'One World is not enough':

the 'myth' of Roman Catholicism a 'World Religion'

Cambridge, 29 September 2016

> Great and grievous and never enough to be bewailed, has been the scandal given in the Churches of the Reformation; in that so very little, yea, next to nothing, has been done in them, for the Propagation of the Faith, which breathes nothing but the most unexceptional Wisdom and Goodness… While at the same time, the Church of Rome strives with an unwearied and extravagant labour, to propagate the Idolatry and Superstiton of Anti-Christ and advance the Empire of Satan. And the missionaries and brokers of that harlot, are indeed more than can be numbered.

So wrote Cotton Mather, prominent New England Congregationalist minister, in a letter of December 1717, written in Latin to Bartholomeus Ziegenhalg, co-founder of the Halle Pietiest mission in the Danish colony of Tranquebar in S. India.[1] This elicited a reply, from Johan Ernst Gründler, (Ziegenhalg having died in the meantime), which contained the following passage:

---

1 Cotton Mather, *India Christiana. A discourse, delivered unto the Commissioners, for the Propagation of the Gospel among the American Indians : which is accompanied with several instruments relating to the glorious design of propagating our holy religion, in the Eastern as well as the Western, Indies. : An entertainment which they that are waiting for the kingdom of God will receive as good news from a far country,* (Boston: B. Green, 1721**),** p. 64. The English translation is contemporary since this edition gives facing Latin and English texts. My thanks to Jan Stievermann for drawing this text to my attention.

> As to the Popish Missions in this our India, they are thought more Numerous than ours; insomuch that they say, there are no less than Two Thousand who here go to and fro in the Earth.[2]

As Thomas Kidd has taught us, the new language of Protestantism involved identification with 'an international Protestant community, beleaguered but faithful world community of Christians reformed from the corruptions of Catholicism'.[3] Furthermore, this percieved global threat of Catholicism was interpreted in eschatological terms: the last raging of the Antichrist before his Fall. To Mather, the death of Louis XIV, the failure of the Stuart uprisings, and the Hanoverian succession to the English throne in 1714 were providential tokens which led him to observe that 'we have now seen the sun rising in the [American] West.'[4]

For those attempting to understand the Global spread of Roman Catholicism in the early modern period, the fact that Protestant missionaries clearly conceived the Church of Rome in such terms testifies to the contemporary impact of what I shall argue was essentially the 'myth' of Roman Catholicism as a 'world religion'. Before proceeding any further, I should specify that I am

---

[2] Mather, *India Christiana*, p. 85.

[3] Thomas Kidd, *The Protestant Interest: New England after Puritanism*, (New Haven/London: Yale University Press, 2004), p. 2.

[4] Mather, *India Christiana*, p. 33. Cfr. Edward Simon, 'Heterodox Puritanism, and the construction of America' in Crawford Gribben & Scott Spurlock eds., *Puritans and Catholics in the Trans-Atlantic world, 1600-1800*, (Basingtoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), pp. 164-74.

using ‘myth’ not in the sense of something that is not ‘true’, but according to its alternative meaning as a useful story or narrative which has been artfully constructed out of a selective representation of the factual record. Moreover, to continue the task of clarifying a few key terms, in what follows I will be using ‘world religion’ *not* in the sense made canonical by the 19th-century Sanskrit scholar and founder of the discipline of comparative religion – or *Religionswissenschaft* – Friedrich Max Müller (1823-1900), but rather in the vernacular sense of the term: as a mode of ritual practice and set of beliefs that enjoyed trans-continental diffusion. For Müller, it was axiomatic that:

> in the history of the world, our religion, like our language, is but one out of many and that in order to understand fully the position of Christianity in the history of the world and its true place among the religions of mankind, we must compare it with the aspirations of the whole world.[5]

In this way, it might perhaps be said, with Luke Clossey, that comparative philology begat comparative religion; to paraphrase what Goethe said of language, which Max Müller took as his motto: ‘He who knows one religion, knows none’. [6] The nineteenth century thus saw the emergence of such ‘constructed’ categories; which are therefore to be considered as offspring of what was an essentially

---

[5] F. Max Müller, *Chips from a German Workshop*, 4 vols, (New York: Charles Scribner, 1871-76), vol. I, p. xxvi.

[6] Luke Clossey, ‘Belief, knowledge, and language’ in David Christian ed. *The Cambridge World History, vol. I , Introducing World History, to 10,000 BCE*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), pp. 132-64 (at 138).

Eurocentric, colonialist mentality that, in the words of the author of *The Invention of Religion in Japan*, J. Ānanda Josephson, the word 'religion': 'mask[ed] the globalisation of particular Euro-American concerns, which have been presented as universal aspects of human experience' [7] Nevertheless, as Alan Strathern points out, one must be careful not to 'genealogise' such concepts out of existence; after all, concepts and categories are, by their very nature, made not found.[8]

In a recent, comprehensive study of what was meant by the concept of 'faith' in the Roman world at the time of the emergence of Christianity, Teresa Morgan reminds us that the Greek word *pistis* - which occurs fourteen times in Paul's first letter to the Thessalonians though it is a mere five chapters long - did not reference 'belief' but rather trust, allegiance and loyalty (or *fides* as

[7] J. Ānanda Josephson, *The Invention of Religion in Japan*, (Chicago/London, 2012), 3. The dates of 'birth' of these world religions are taken from Michel Gardaz, 'History of the discipline of the study of religion' in P. Clark & P. Beyer eds., *The World's religions: continuities and transformations*, (New York, 2009), 276-89 (at 279). Cfr. T. Asad, *Genealogies of Religion: discipline and reasons of power in Christianity and Islam*, (Baltimore MD, 1993), pp. 27-54; L. Jensen, *Manufacturing Confucianism: Chinese traditions and universal civilization*, (Durham NC, 1997); D. Lopez, *From Stone to Flesh: a short history of the Buddha*, (Chicago, 2013); S. Ahmed, *What is Islam? The Importance of being Islamic*, (Princeton NJ, 2016), pp. 176-245. Judaism too has a claim to have been 'invented' as a religion in 1783 with the publication of Moses Mendelssohn's *Jerusalem oder über religiöse Macht und Judentum.* Cfr L. Batnitzky, *How Judaism became a religion: an introduction to modern Jewish thought*, (Princeton/Oxford, 2011).

[8] Alan Strathern, personal communication to author, May 2016. See now Strathern's latest thoughts on the topic in his: *Unearthly powers. Religious and political change in World History*, (Cambridge, 2019), in particular pp. 27-106. Cfr. M. Lambek, 'What is "Religion" for Anthropology? And what has Anthropology brought to Religion?' in J. Boddy & M. Lambek eds., *A Companion to the Anthropology of Religion,* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 1-31.

it becomes in the Vulgate).[9] This points to the importance of *personal* relationships over *theological* propositions to religious conversion in the first Christian centuries. Such a focus on the affective over the cognitive, I believe, is also relevant when considering how religion can be best understood in the early modern period – and indeed much later. [10]

By conceptualizing religion, first and foremost, as interpersonal, visible behaviour rather than private, interior belief – religion *as verb* over religion *as noun* if you like – it is easier to appreciate the degree to which certain behaviours entailed certain beliefs. In the case of Tridentine Roman Catholicism, the reaffirmation of such prominent acts of ortho*praxy* as the lighting of candles before images, praying for the souls of the dead, the veneration of saints and the (forty-hour) devotion to the host displayed in monstrances on high altars or paraded in procession, indicated ortho*doxy* and thereby provided the most obvious markers of confessional identity as well as the most visible targets for Protestant iconoclasts. Such an emphasis on ortho*praxy* over ortho*doxy* to describe Tridentine Catholicism might seem eccentric in the light of the fact that the Council of Trent provided, in its

[9] Teresa Morgan *Roman Faith and Christian Faith: Pistis and Fides in the early Roman Empire and early Churches*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015).

[10] A similar observation has, for example, been made in relation to understanding contemporary Jihadism by the anthropologist Scott Atran, *Talking to the Enemy: violent extremism, sacred values and what it means to be human*. (London: Allen Lane, 2010).

decrees and canons first published altogether in 1564, a template for Roman Catholicism which endured for almost exactly 400 years (down to the Second Vatican Council). However, as John O'Malley has recently reminded us, so many of the Council's decrees were sketchy, hurried, incomplete or even silent on key matters, it was left to the bishops, those 'building blocks' of the Tridentine Church, (to borrow again from O'Malley) to establish what it all meant: local ortho*praxies* within ortho*doxy*.[11]

Historians are usually warned that they should forget the future and try to view the period they study, as far as possible, only in its own terms. Hindsight is seen as a hindrance. However, it can also be a help, which I believe to be the case here. We need to remember that Christianity, let alone Roman Catholicism, was not yet a world religion, at least geographically speaking, even by the middle of the *twentieth* century. This becomes less surprising when we bear in mind that, according to the informed 'guesstimates' of Massimo Livi-Bacci, based on the earlier work of Jean-Noël Biraben, if in 1400 AD the population of the world stood at 375 million (of which Europe contained 63 million); in 1700 the proportion had scarcely changed, with Europe on 121 million (as against a guesstimated world population of 680 million). Put another way, if in 1400 Europe's share of the world population

[11] John O'Malley, *Trent: what happened at the Council*, (Cambridge MASS: Belknap press, 2013).

stood at 17%, three hundred years later it still stood at just 18%. This is compared to overwhelmingly non-Christian Asia, whose population over the same period had risen from 203 to 437 million; in other words from just over half the world population to just under two-thirds (54-64%).[12]

.

Nevertheless, given the spectacular rise during the nineteenth century in the number of Christians in proportion to the total world population - from 22-36% (200-550 million – the corresponding figures for Roman Catholics show an increase from 106 to 266 million) - it is still surprising – shocking even - to learn that not a single African was invited to attend the landmark World Missionary conference that met in Edinburgh in 1910.[13] Turning to the twentieth century, if we focus on Roman Catholicism in Africa: in 1955 there were only about 16 million adherents, up from 9 million in 1900; by 1978 this had risen to 55 million and today it stands at over 170 million. By 2025 an expected 230 million Africans will represent one sixth of the world population of Roman

---

[12] Sanjay Subramanyam, 'Introduction' to Jerry Bentley, Sanjay Subrahmanyam & Merry Wiesner-Hanks eds., The *Cambridge World History, vol. 6: the Construction of a Global World, 1400-1800 CE, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), part 1, Foundations,* p. 14.

[13]For these figures see: http://www.gordonconwell.edu/ockenga/research/documents/GlobalChristianityinfographic.pdfPg1.pdf (Last accessed 1 February 2019). Cfr. David Barrett & Todd Johnson, *World Christian Trends*, (Pasadena CA: William Carey, 2001). For the non-attendance of African delegates at the World Missionary conference see Andrew F. Walls, 'Christianity in the non-western world: a study in the serial nature of Christian expansion', *Studies in World Christianity*, 6 (1995), pp. 1-25 (at 7).

http://www.gordonconwell.edu/ockenga/research/documents/GlobalChristianityinfographic.pdfPg1.pdf (Last accessed 1 February 2019). Cfr. David Barrett & Todd Johnson, *World Christian Trends*, (Pasadena CA: William Carey, 2001).

Catholics.[14] This will represent a sea-change in the regional distribution of Christianity in the world, since as recently as 2010 there were equal numbers of Christians in Europe, Latin America and Africa, representing some 75% of the world's total (at around 25% each). It has also been speculated that by 2050 one in four Christians in Europe and N. America will be from the 'Christian' South.[15]

Nevertheless, as I have written elsewhere, if the *making* of Roman Catholicism as a world religion was not in fact realised until sub-saharan Africa found Catholicism in the second half of the last century, the early modern period certainly did witness the triumph of the *idea* of Roman Catholicism as a faith with global reach if not grasp.[16] This is perhaps seen most graphically in one of the emblems taken from that extraordinary monument to the printers' and engravers' art which celebrated the centenary of the Society of Jesus and was put together by the Jesuits of the Flemish province in

[14] According to the Brian Grim, Todd Johnson et al., eds., *Yearbook of International Religious demography 2018,* (Leiden/Boston: Brill 2018), this year marks the first year that Africa has the most Christians – 30 million more than Latin America.

[15] Philip Jenkins, *The Next Christendom: the coming of Global Christianity*, 3rd edition, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2111), pp. 72-74. For a still hermeneutically helpful argument that, by contrast, 'European religion is not a model for export; it is something distinct, particular to the European corner of the world, and needs to be understood as such' see Grace Davie, *Europe: the exceptional case. Parameters of Faith in a Modern World*, (London, 2002), passim (quotation at p. x).

[16] Simon Ditchfield, 'Catholic Reformation and Renewal' in Peter Marshall ed., *Oxford Illustrated history of the Reformation*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), pp. 152-85.

1640: the *Imago primi saeculi*.[17] This 952-page folio production also provided, on a heroic scale, exempla of both neo-classical Latin panegyric as well as of the art of the emblem – 127 of which concluded the prolegomena and the six books into which the *Imago* is divided. In book two, which was entitled: 'Societas crescens', one finds the emblem of a young, winged child standing between two globes showing the two hemispheres of the world. This image is immediately below the words: 'Societatis Missiones Indicae' ('The missions to the Indies of the Society') and directly above the words: 'Unus non sufficit orbis' ('One World is not enough'). The first three lines of the poem that is printed beneath run: 'What aspect of a highborn soul shall I say that this is?/This boy extends his embraces in front of each of the two globes/Tell me, boy: is your heart broader than the whole/ of earth and is each world smaller than your soul?'[18] Book II opens with another emblem, whose motto reads: 'When once it is lit, it will then and there fill the world with light'. The first phrase: 'Ut semel accensa est' was lifted directly out of the poem *Aetna,* which in the 17th century was still believed to have been written by Virgil. A few lines further down we get another example of neo-classical linguistic word play – in the form of a pun on the name 'Ignatius' with 'Ignis' – 'Ignatius with his holy

[17] *Imago primi saeculi societatis Iesu a provincia Flandro-Belgica eiusdem societatis repraesentata*, (Antwerp: Plantin, 1640).
[18] This translation is taken from John O'Malley ed. *Art, Controversy and the Jesuits: the Imago primi saeculi (1640)*, (Philadelphia: St Joseph's University Press, 2015), pp. 524-25 [p. 326 of 1640 edn].

fires has set aflame wherever the huge stretch of earth lies open and has glowed with fire'.[19]

A much better known image on this theme is Andrea Pozzo's dizzying fresco: 'The worldwide mission of the Society of Jesus' which covered the nave ceiling of S. Ignazio in Rome: a church that was physically integrated into what was the largest education complex in Western Europe until the 19th century: the Collegio Romano in central Rome. The church of S. Ignazio's prominent role in the cerimonial and liturgical life of the students at the Society's pre-eminent educational establishment made it even more central to the daily routine of the many future Jesuit missionaries who studied or taught there than the Society's mother church of il Gesù located fewer than 500 metres away. Pozzo's fresco was carried out between 1691-94 and has become the 'go-to' image for any publisher, author or lecturer who wants a striking picture to stand for the making of Roman Catholicism as a world religion in the early modern period. By this period in the history of the Society of Jesus, its founder had come to stand for the Order as a whole, as can be seen from the frontispiece to the Jesuit Daniello Bartoli's life of Ignatius of 1650, which the author, under official commission from the Jesuit Father General, regarded as the first part of what became a multi-volume, though incomplete history of the Society as a truly global phenomenon **[ILLUSTRATION – courtesy of ARSI**

[19] O'Malley, *Art, Controversy and the Jesuits*, pp. 506-07 [p. 317 of 1640 edn].

– SEE ATTACHMENT].[20] Note Ignatius's role here as intermediary who deflects divine light so that it spreads through the whole world, which is represented here by the four personifications of Africa, America, Europe and Asia.

Between them, the *Imago primi saeculi* and Pozzo's fresco have done much to ensure that the early modern chapter in the history of global Catholic missions continues to be viewed largely through a Jesuit lens. They have also ensured that the Society almost always enjoys poll position in any chapter or book devoted to the contribution of the regular clergy to this story. This status has been confirmed, crucially, by the quality and extent of the Jesuit archives in Rome, which reflect the Society's highly centralised structure and governance as well as the key role played from the outset by such key figures as the founder's secretary, Juan Alfonso de Polanco (1517-76).[21] The *Constitutions* of the Society, published in 1558 just two years after the founder's death, required Superiors of individual Jesuit houses to write weekly to their

[20] *Della vita e dell'instituto di S. Ignatio fondatore della compagnia di Giesu libri cinque*, (Rome: D. Manelfi, 1650), the anteportam is reproduced by courtesy of the Archivum historicum societatis Iesu (Roman Archive of the Society of Jesus). My sincere thanks to Mauro Brunelli for his assistance here.

[21] Edmond Lamalle, 'L'archivio di un grande Ordine religioso: l'archivio Generale della Compagnia di Gesù', *L'Archiva ecclesiae*, 24-25 (1981-82), pp. 89-120, (downloadable at: http://www.sjweb.info/arsi/documents/Lamalle.pdf - last accessed 13/6/18); Robert Danieluk, *The Roman Jesuit Archives*, (n.p. n.d.) downloadable at http://www.sjweb.info/arsi/documents/ARSI-english%20guide%20Februari%202012.pdf (last accessed 13/6/18). Cfr. Paul Nelles, '*Cosas y cartas*: Scribal Production and Material Pathways in Jesuit Global Communication (1547–1573).' *Journal of Jesuit Studies,* 2 (2015): 421–50; idem.,'Jesuit Letters' in Ines Županov ed., *The Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits,* (Oxford, 2019), pp. 44-72.

Provincial who, in turn, was obliged to write to the Superior General, also on a weekly basis if close and monthly if located at a greater distance from Rome. Although this level of frequency was soon abandoned as impracticable, a Jesuit letter-writing manual of 1620 refers to at least sixteen different kinds of documents which Provincials were obliged to send to Rome on a regular basis.[22] The resulting archive offers scholars the opportunity to gauge the grasp as well as measure the reach of an institution which is only comparable to the archives of the papacy itself in its claim to command a genuinely global frame of reference. However, missionary priests were invariably thin on the ground, and a disproportionate number were resident in urban centres of the Western Catholic world. A census taken of all the provinces of the Society of Jesus dating from 1626 included in the *Imago primi saeculi* makes this crystal clear.[23] Although there were 808 Jesuits distributed between Goa (320), the Malabar coast (190), the Philippines (128), Cocinchina with Japan (140) and China, only 30 were based on the Chinese mainland itself. This contrasts with the no fewer than 1,574 members of the Society distributed between the two provinces that made up Belgium (Flandro- and Franco-

[22] George Ganss ed., *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, (St Louis MO: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1970), pp. 292-93, paragraphs 673-76; Markus Friedrich, 'Communication and bureaucracy in the early modern Society of Jesus', *Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Religions- und Kulturgeschichte*, 101 (2007), pp. 49-75 (at 56). Cfr. Friedrich, *Der lange Arm Roms? Globale Verwaltung und Kommunikation im Jesuitenorden, 1540-1773*, (Frankfurt/New York: Campus, 2011).

[23] *Imago primi saeculi*, pp. 238-46. These figures make no distinction between the different grades of Jesuit: from scholastic and novice to the fully professed via the ranks of temporal and spiritual coadjutor.

Belgica), which were, outside Rome (with 810), easily the most densely settled two provinces of the entire order. The distribution across the Old World is surprisingly even but with a tendency to added strength on the northern and eastern frontiers of the Roman Catholic world. There were just under 2,300 in the Italian peninsula and its islands (including 661 in Sicily and 210 in Sardinia), just over 1,800 in the Iberian pensula (with a 1:2 distribution between Portugal and Spain, at 660 and 1194 respectively); 1,409 in France (incl. New France); 267 in 'England' which included Scotland and Ireland, (most of whom were resident in the various English colleges in Spain, Portugal Rome and N. France), 1,638 in the German-speaking lands (including 450 in Austria and 287 in Bohemia) with 532 in Poland and 468 in Lithuania. In the Americas, where the Jesuits were part of second wave of missionaries beginning with their arrival in Brazil (1549), Florida (1566) Peru (1569) and Mexico (1572), the emphasis was very much on S. America: with 200 in the province of New Granada (consisting of modern-day Venezuela, Colombia and Bolivia), 390 in Peru, 60 in Chile, 121 in Paraguay and 180 in Brazil (a total of 951). By contrast, there were only 365 in the Central American province of New Spain.

As if such thorough recording habits were not sufficient to ensure the Jesuits a pre-eminent place in most histories of the

making of Roman Catholicism as a world religion, the Society and its members were also responsible for the publication of official (i.e. carefully edited) accounts of their overseas missions to a degree unrivalled by any other of the religious orders, which were sometimes published by printers who specialised in such literature.[24] These were the so-called annual letters (*litterae annuae*), which were complemented by equally official, (albeit incomplete), histories of the order in both Latin (by Niccolò Orlandini, 1554-1606 and Francesco Sacchini, 1570-1625 which covered just the founder's lifetime) and the vernacular, (most famously by Daniello Bartoli (1608-87), whose multi-volume account did not include the Americas but which for its epic qualities later earned for its author the sobriquet 'Dante of Italian prose'). [25] There were also inummerable works of mission-related literature: from accounts of heroic martyrdom to works of natural history and ethnography, which continue to be discovered and printed for the first time down to this day.[26]

[24] As was the case with the Paris-based printer Sébastian Cramoisy who published over a period of forty years accounts of Jesuit missions in New France. See Amélie Hamel, 'Translating as a way of writing history: Father Du Creux's *Historiae Canadensis* and the *Relations jésuites* of New France,' *Renaissance studies*, 29 (2015), pp. 143-61.

[25] On the *litterae annuae* as well as Nelles, 'Jesuit Letters' cited above at n. 20 see also Donald Lach, *Asia in the making of Europe* vol. III, bk. 1, pp. 368-79, 388-89, 402-04, 510-15. Cfr. Markus Friedrich, 'Circulating and Compiling the *Litterae Annuae*. Towards a History of the Jesuit System of Communication", *AHSI* 153 (2008), p. 3-39. Orlandini's history was completed by Sacchini and published in 1614 as *Historiae societatis iesu, prima pars, sive Ignatius*. Bartoli's account was published between 1650 and 1673, beginning with the *Vita e dell'istituto di S. Ignazio* and continuing with volumes on Jesuit missions in Asia [mainly India] (1653); Japan (1660); China (1663); England (1667) and Italy (1673).

[26] Although for a fuller list of works written by members of the Society, not only relating to its history, reference is usually made to Charles Sommervogel's 12-volume: *Bibliothèque de la compagnie de Jésus,* (1890-1932) and now its online

However, it was martyrdom which undoubtedly constituted their single most important claim for missionary pre-eminence as well as the principal 'lieux de memoire' for Jesuit collective identity. It was not only central to the subject matter of so many individual *vitae* of heroic Jesuits who lost their lives on the missions from Nagasaki to New France, Tyburn to Transylvania, but also became the organising principle of the one truly global history of the Society's missionary activity that was completed in this period: *The Society of Jesus miltant for [the defence of] God, Faith, Church and Piety prepared to lose their lives and shed their own blood in Europe, Africa, Asia and America against gentiles, mohammedans, Jews, heretics and impious* by the Pilsen-born Mathias Tanner (1630-92).[27] As with the Antwerp-printed *Imago primi saeculi*, this too was the product not of the Roman Catholic heartlands but of a frontier zone: Prague, which had only been secured from Protestant overlordship as recently as 1620, (just ten years before

successor: *The New Sommervogel online* (NSO)): www.brill.com/nso, perhaps a more revealing overview for the early modern period is offered by the first bio-bibliographical survey of the Jesuits, commissioned by Claudio Acquaviva from Ignatius's first biographer: Pedro de Ribadeneyra (1526-1611), whose *Illustrium scriptorum religionis societatis Iesu catalogus* was first published in 1608 and then in a revised and expanded edition (including works in manuscript) by Philippe Algambe, aided by Jean Bolland, in 1643 (*Bibliotheca scriptorum societatis Iesu*). For a recently rediscovered manuscript work see: François-Marc Gagnon et al eds., *Codex Canadensis and the writings of Louis Nicolas,* (Montreal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University press, 2011).

[27] *Societas Jesu usque ad sanguinis et vitae profusionem militans in Europa, Africa, Asia, et America, contra Gentiles, Mahometanos, Judaeos, Haereticos, Impios, pro Deo, Fide, Ecclesia, Pietate : sive vita et mors eorum qui ex Societate Jesu in causa Fidei, & Virtutis propugnatae, violenta morte toto Orbe sublati sunt*, (Prague: Typis Universitatis Carolo-Ferdinandeae, in Collegio Societatis Jesu ad S. Clementem, 1675).

the author's own birth). Tanner's martyrology also shared with the *Imago* ornate Latin prose, which suggests that its primary audience were members of the Society itself, particularly those who were training to go (or fantasising about going) on dangerous missions to Protestant lands or the Indies and wrote pleading letters to the Superior General to that effect.

It is well known that the Roman archives of the Jesuits still possess no fewer than 14,067 such letters, dating from 1583 to 1773, from those who sought to travel 'to the Indies' (*litterae indipetae*), where 'Indies' not only included the Americas but any destination where there was danger and likelihood of martyrdom (incl. England).[28] Less well known is the fact that not a few petitioners wrote several such letters, (as reflected in the fact that there were just 5,167 different correspondents) and, notwithstanding that the Jesuits carefully curated a prodigious quantity of information - both printed and manuscript - about the overseas missions, understanding of the Indies displayed by the letter writers tended to be geographically vague and framed in terms of spiritual and mystical cliché.[29] Even less well understood

[28] They have been preserved at ARSI, *F.G. 732-59* which is helpfully described in E. Lamalle, 'La documentation d'histoire missionaire dans le 'fondo gesuitico' aux archives romaines de la compagnie de Jesus', *Euntes docete* 21 (1968), pp.138-76 (at 160-62). The classic study remains Carlo Roscioni, *Il desiderio delle Indie: storie, sogni e fughe di giovani gesuiti italiani*, (Turin: Einaudi, 2001). For the use of the terms 'Indies' and 'New World' to encompass not only the Americas but also Asia see Alexander Nagel, 'Amerasia: European reflections of an emergent world c.1492-1700', *JEMH*, forthcoming.

[29] Camilla Russell, 'Imagining the 'Indies': Italian Jesuit petitions for the overseas missions at the turn of the seventeenth century' in M. Donattini, G. Marcocci &

are the reasons why, given the recurrent shortage of missionaries available for the extra-European missions, (and the Jesuits were no exception here), the success rate of applications to go on the missions was not higher. Partly, this is because of the difficulties of tracing the replies from successive Superior Generals but also, counter-intuitively in light of the prominent role Jesuits have played in accounts of the making of Roman Catholicism as a world religion, in reality the Society felt it had need of its best men in the Old World.[30] To put it another way, as Francis Xavier himself observed in a letter to Ignatius Loyola from Cochin on the west coast of India dated 27 January 1545, one needed to match the missionaries to the various tasks at hand.[31] For work amongst the humble fisherfolk on the Malabar coast, for example, simply those with the physical strength to undertake such repetitive tasks as the teaching of basic prayers to indigenous catechists and baptising of infants were required. Those who were physically less robust but who possessed the talent for hearing confessions and preaching should be reserved for Goa and Cochin where they could minister to the mainly Portuguese Christians.

S. Pastore eds., *L'Europa divisa e i nuovi mondi: per Adriano Prosperi* (Pisa: Edizioni della Normale, 2011), pp. 179-89. For discussion of the *litterae indipetae* after 1814 and down to the 20th century see the essays in: Guido Mongini & Emanuele Colombo eds., '"L'ardentissima brama" delle missioni. Nuove fonti per la storia della Compagnia de Gesù tra Otto e Novecento – percorsi di ricerca nelle lettere *indipetae*', *Ricerche di storia sociale e religiosa*, XLV/88 (2016), 9-152.

[30] For a fascinating case study where it has been possible to examine both sides of the correspondence see Elisa Frei, 'The many faces of Ignazio Maria Romeo SJ (1676-1724?), petitioner for the Indies: a Jesuit seen through the *litterae indipetae* and the *epistulae generalium*', *AHSI*, 170, (2016), pp. 365-404.

[31] M. Joseph Costelloe ed., *Letters and Instructions of Francis Xavier*, (St Louis MI: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1992), pp. 113-15.

The fact that within five years of the foundation of the Society Xavier was making such clear distinctions and expressing the need to match the talents and capacities of its members to particular tasks at hand is one that goes surprisingly unremarked. Accounts of the Society and, in particular, its spectacular expansion during its first century, rarely break down the numbers to identify how many of the total were fully professed priests (i.e. had taken the fourth vow of special obedience to the pope 'in regard to missions'); spiritual coadjutors (i.e. priested and therefore qualified to preach, teach and hear confession) and, finally, simple lay brothers, or to give them their formal title, temporal coadjutors. Those who belonged to this last grade, who also took vows of poverty, chastity and obedience, constituted, together with the spiritual coadjutors, between at least a quarter and a third of those in any single community.[32] Temporal coadjutors usually had a particular manual trade, which might also include architects and artists, (as was the case with Andrea Pozzo, who frescoed the nave ceiling of S. Ignazio in Rome mentioned above as well as corridor outside Loyola's rooms next to the Gesù). The status of this last grade, who were sometimes simply referred to as 'brothers', was set out very clearly in the so-called 'General Examen' for the evaluation of prospective candidates, where it was stated that such a candidate, once

[32] Decree 82 para. 3 from the 6th General Congregation (1616) in John Padberg et al eds., *For matters of greater moment: the first thirty Jesuit General Congregations,* (St Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1994) p. 275.

accepted, should not: 'seek more learning than he had when he entered'.[33] It was a distinction which came to be enforced ever more vigorously, as can be seen from a decree of 1616 which mandated that temporal coadjutors:

> should wear the soutane about five inches shorter [than the priest's] and a cloak shorter than the soutane.... In the matter of headgear, those who in future are to come to the Society as coadjutors are forbidden to affect any use whatever of the clerical hat [*biretta*] such as priests and scholastics have been accustomed to wear...[34]

Liam Brockey, in his pointedly anti-heroic account of the 17th-century Jesuit mission to Asia as reflected in the career of Portuguese Visitor (i.e. inspector) of the Society's missions in India and China, André Palmeiro (Lisbon 1569-Macau 1635) confirms the numerical significance of those who were neither fully professed or priests, but whose manual labours enabled the Jesuit colleges to function. By painstakingly reconstructing the circumstances surrounding the particularly brutal murder of the temporal coadjutor in charge of hiring help at the Jesuit college in Coimbra by one of the other lay servants, Brockey draws attention to the horizontal (as well as vertical) tensions which must have simmered

[33] 'The General Examen', ch. 6, para 117 in Ganss, *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*], p. 114. This was a distinctive feature of the Jesuits: 'In the older orders it is clear that everyone, priests, choir brothers and laymen, make solemn profession after their novitiate'. See Antonnio de Adalma, *An introductory commentary on the Constitutions*, (Rome/St Louis: Institute of Jesuit sources/Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis, 1989), p. 27.

[34] Decree 24 para 1 & 2 from the 6th General Congregation in Padberg et al, *For matters of greater moment*, p. 259.

away in many a Jesuit community.[35] Brockey has also emphasised the just how much the numerically insignificant Jesuit missionaries relied on lay (and female) catechists in rural China and Eugenio Menegon has taught us how Christianity was able to take root in parts of 17th-century rural Fuan, partly as a result of Dominican missionaries.[36] In none of these cases could missionaries be described by any stretch of the imagination as 'agents of empire'.

Words more commonly used nowadays by historians to describe the role of missionaries are: 'go-between', 'intermediary' or 'broker'. Alida Metcalf's account of the actions of the first Jesuits in Portuguese Brazil, led by Manoel da Nóbrega and Josė de Anchieta, emphasises, for example, not only their early appreciation of the potential of indigenous children as well as those of Portuguese fathers and Indian mothers, the so called *mamelucos/as,* as interpreters and teachers, but also of the importance of presenting their teaching in ways that accorded with local customs and preferences; in particular, the adoption of indigenous music and instruments.[37] On one occasion Nóbrega and Anchieta even placed themselves in the hands of the Tupimambá as

---

[35] Liam Brockey, *The Visitor: André Palmeiro and the Jesuits in Asia*, (Cambridge MA/London: Belknap Press, 2014), pp. 52-53.

[36] Brockey, *Journey to the East*, pp. 357ff; Eugenio Menegon, *Ancestors, friars and virgins: Christianity as a local religion in late Imperial China*, (Cambridge MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2009). Cfr. for the wider historiographical context: David Mungello, 'Reinterpreting the history of Christianity in China', *Historical Journal*, 55 (2012), 533-52.

[37] Alida C. Metcalf, *Go-betweens and the colonization of Brazil, 1500-1600*, (Austin TX: University of Texas press, 2005).

hostages in an (unsuccessful) attempt to broker peace between the tribe and the Portuguese Governor.

The significant role of indigenous children in the proselytization of Roman Catholicism is a prominent feature too of St Francis Xavier's first letters from India, describing his mission on the Malabar coast, which were widely translated and circulated on their arrival in Europe. As in Ming and Qing China, thanks to the studies of Nicolas Standaert and M. Antoni Üçerler, the Jesuits remained very dependent of course not only upon children but also on the co-operation of local elites.[38] Paolo Aranha has recently shown in his important re-interpretation of the so-called Malabar Rites controversy how: 'far from being an enlightened experiment of early modern missionaries, [whereby the Jesuits consciously sought to mix Christianity with local religions] the Malabar Rites were primarily an expression of the prevailing agency of the leading native converts'.[39] The Rites in question, he argues, including modes of dress and diet but also, crucially, the separation of sacred space to preserve the hierarchy of caste, were in fact

[38] Nicolas Standaert, *Chinese voices in the Rites controversy: travelling books, community networks, intercultural arguments*, (Rome: Institutum historicum societatis Iesu, 2012); M. Antoni Üçerler, The Jesuits in East Asia in the Early Modern Age: A New "Areopagus" and the "Re-invention" of Christianity' in Thomas Banchoff and José Casanova eds., Thomas Banchoff and José Casanova eds., *The Jesuits and Globalization: historical legacies and contemporary challenges*, (Georgetown: Georgetown University Press, 2016), pp. 27-47.

[39] Paolo Aranha, 'The social and physical spaces of the Malabar Rites controversy' in Giuseppe Marcocci, Wietse de Boer, Aliocha Maldavsky and Ilaria Pavan eds., *Space and Conversion in global perspective*, (Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2015), pp. 214-31 (at 215).

Christianized Hindu *samskāras* (sacramental rituals), rather than mere cultural traits, accepted to render Christianity more palatable to non-European peoples, as argued disingenously by, for example, the Jesuit missionary Roberto De Nobili (1577-1656), who reinvented himself as a Brahmin Holy Man.[40]

Turning to Latin America, as a counterpart to the relatively recent awareness of the important role played by Indian *conquistadores* – indigenous allies such as the Tlaxcalans who outnumbered Cortes' forces by 10:1 in the coalitions' defeat of the Aztec leader Moctezuma - in the Spanish conquest of Mesoamerica, scholars are now ready to acknowledge the role played by native church assistants (*indios ladinos*) throughout Spanish and Portuguese America in the making of (and sometimes in the subverting of) Christian society. In his careful study of such indigenous agents in the Andean Church from 1583-1671, John Charles shows how these key intermediaries could be seen to exemplify the correct assimilation of Hispanic Christian values and therefore as models to be imitated by their fellow Indians – as is the case of one of the native-language sermons published, on the authority of the Third Council of Lima, under the direction of the Jesuit missionary José de Acosta in 1585, which includes the words: 'They are good sons and pray and confess many times during the

[40] For a comparative picture of the role played by accommodation in Jesuit missions see now the important volume: Ines Županov and Pierre Antoine Favre, eds., *The Rites Controversies in the Early Modern World* (Leiden: Brill, 2018).

year and discipline themselves. They are blessed by God and the padres love them very much. Why would you not do the same?'[41] Alternatively, they could be seen as perpetrators of forbidden idolatrous cults, as in the case of a parish priest, Francisco de Ávila, who in 1608 complained: '[T]he [*indios ladinos*] teach [the parishioners] to worship idols and they take them to make sacrifices, just as Christians take their own to Church'.[42] Or as Charles himself prefers to see it: 'while theoretically literacy was essential for bringing Andean peoples into the Christian fold, its practice in the hands of native subjects thwarted the Church's efforts to evangelise on its own terms'.[43]

Widespread resistence to the ordination of indigenous candidates to the priesthood from the mid-sixteenth century to the very end of the seventeenth (and beyond) stands as one of the more spectacular missed opportunities in the history of Roman Catholicism. This makes it even more important for us to consider the role played by the 'silent majority' of non-indian or creole priests in the process of cultural translation. In the words of William Taylor, from his case-study of an eighteenth-century Franciscan friar who served as pastor of a *doctrina* (protoparish) on the outskirts of Mexico City, and devoted himself to restoring a

[41] John Charles, *Allies at Odds: the Andean Church and its indigenous agents, 1583-1671*, (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2010), p. 3.
[42] Charles, *Allies at Odds*, ibid.
[43] Charles, *Allies at Odds*, 9.

miraculous statue of Our Lady in the face of local, Indian indifference, on the one hand, and the wariness of the ecclesiastical authorities, on the other:

> Parish priests were not just disembodied voices of official doctrine, orthodoxy and institutional order. A seminary education, ordination, liturgical duties, and an institutional career did not wash away all the habits of faith they brought to the priesthood. The devotional practices they knew from childhood; their preference for particular saints and Marian advocations, holidays, scriptural passages, prayers, places and miracle stories; their talents and inclinations as public figures and practitioners of the faith; and their personal sense of calling to the priesthood may all come into play'. [44]

In other words; ''local religion' sprang not only from the laity but also was often shaped by parish priests whose religious conceptions, as in this case, were not necessarily aligned with either their flock or their bishops.

If one were to make an honest appraisal of world geo-politics in around 1500, the subsequent global spread of Roman Catholicism seemed highly unlikely. To begin with, Columbus

[44] William Taylor, 'Between Nativitas and Mexico City' in Martin A. Nesvig ed., *Local Religion in Colonial Mexico*, (Alburquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2006), 91-117.

famously failed to find what he was looking for – a short cut to the East, (which from time the collapse of the Roman Empire down to the mid-nineteenth century was unquestionably the wealthiest part of the globe), rather than the discovery of a 'New World'. The promise and potential of the Americas as either a fertile field of Christian conversion or for economic exploitation had yet to make its impact. Save for such relatively isolated communities as the Syriac 'Thomas' Christians of south-western India, the Syriac Maronite Church of Antioch, the minority Coptic Church of Egypt, and the Coptic Kingdom of Ethiopia, Christendom was boxed into the western extremity of the Eurasian landmass by considerable Islamic powers, notably the Ottoman Empire to the east and the Mamluk sultanate of Egypt to the south east. In North Africa, from Morroco to Tunis, Portuguese and Spanish influence was precarious and restricted to the coastline. Furthermore, on the coasts of the Sicily and the Italian peninsula, the inhabitants were careful to locate their settlements in secure locations. Although this did little to protect the local population from countless raids made by Barbary corsairs, even if the numbers of those thereby cast into white slavery cannot compete with the numbers of their black counterparts brutally transported across the Atlantic. [45]

[45] See the two contrasting interpretations of Robert C. Davis, *Christian Slaves, Muslim Masters: white slavery in the Mediterranean, Barbary coast and Italy*, (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003) – the maximalist account – versus the much more precise calculations of the admittedly smaller sample in Nabil Matar, *British captives from the Mediterranean to the Atlantic, 1563-1760*, (Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2014).

In East Asia, Islam had been enjoying a wave of continuous expansion ever since the ruler of the Malay port of Melaka decided to adopt Islam sometime between 1409 and 1436 and thereby plug his economy into a flourishing trading network that stretched via Bengal and Hormuz to Cairo and Istanbul. The pace of conversion was to accelerate from c. 1500, in parallel with, and not unrelated to, the arrival of Christianity. In the Americas, the Aztec and Inca Kingdoms had reached their apogee. In China, the Confucian Middle Kingdom of the Ming had admittedly abandoned its early fifteenth-century practice of sending gargantuan armadas on flag-waving voyages as far as East Africa. But this was not in response to hostile reception, but because of perceived irrelevance to China's continental concerns as Asia's most considerable power. In 1501 Shah Esmā'īl (1487-1524) seized Tabriz and inaugurated the Safavid Empire, which unified Iran and which under Shah 'Abbas the Great (1587-1629) reached the climax of its power. In the territory represented by modern-day Afghanistan, Zahir ud-din Babur (1483-1530), the great-great-great grandson of Tamerlane, was poised to invade the Indian subcontinent. He would establish what came to be known as the Mughal Empire, in which a Muslim minority ruled successfully for more than two centuries over a Hindu majority. If the early modern period, as has been argued recently by John Darwin, was in global terms an 'age of empire' then the West had but a single contestant: the Habsburgs, who managed to unite their various Burgundian, Austrian and Spanish

patrimonies with the title of Holy Roman Emperor for just a little under four decades (1519-56).[46] To borrow Gibbon's famous remark that, had it not been for Charles Martel's victory over the Arabs at the battle of Poitiers in 732: 'the interpretation of the Koran would now be taught in the schools of Oxford… [and her pulpits] might demonstrate to a circumcised people the sanctity and truth of the revelation of Mahomet', one might with no less justification remark that had it not been for the need for the Ottomans repeatedly to turn their attention to the Safavid threat on their south-east border, the 137-metre high steeple of Vienna cathedral would merely have been the first such spire to provide the *muezzin* with a substitute for his usual minaret from which to call the faithful to prayer.[47] The 'triumph of the West over the Rest' would have to wait until the late-nineteenth and even early-twentieth centuries.

However, the revised chronology argued for in this chapter combined with a greater sense of the slowness of the spread of Roman Catholicism as a world religion still leaves us with the challenge of understanding how the Christian message was communicated to make it more effective as an instrument of conversion in new environments. The Gambia-born Muslim turned

---

[46] John Darwin, *After Tamerlane: The Global History of Empire since 1405* (London, 2007).

[47] Edward Gibbon, *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, ed. D.Womersley,
6 vols in 3 (London, 1994), 3: 336 (1st edn, 1788, vol. 5, ch. 52). Cfr. J. C. Sharman, *Empires of the Weak: the real story of European expansion and the creation of the New World Order*, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2019).

Roman Catholic scholar, Lamin Sanneh (1942-2019) famously insisted upon Christianity's uniqueness as a *translated* religion without a revealed language. Translation, he averred, is its second nature: 'the Church's birthmark as well as its missionary benchmark'.[48] Accordingly, the transformation of Christianity into a world faith was seen by Sanneh as direct result of 'the triumph of its translatibility'. Of course, there was the difficulty to begin with of *which* language should one translate into, given the intensely fragmented linguistic landscape confronting so many missionaries in (not only) the early modern period. However, as Ines Županov has recently argued, they were assisted from an unlikely quarter: the Council of Trent, whose 25th session, specifically chapter 7 of the Reform decree, mandated that:

> In order that the faithful people may approach to the reception of the sacraments with greater reverence and devotion of mind, the holy Synod enjoins on all bishops, that, not only when they are themselves about to administer them to the people, they shall first explain, in a manner suited to the capacity of those who receive them,

[48] Lamin Sanneh, *Whose Religion is Christianity. The Gospel beyond the West*, (Grand Rapids MI/Cambridge UK: Eerdmans, 2003), p. 97. Though of course his focus on the 19th and 20th centuries and emphasis on Protestantism downplayed the reality that until Vatican II (1962-65) Roman Catholicism preserved Latin, rather than the vernacular, as the sacred language of the liturgy. To adapt slightly Tom Nairn's memorable formulation: the Catholics, en masse, were not invited into history quite so warmly or fully since the invitation card was not written in the vernacular for them to understand. See Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*, revised edn., (London1991), p. 80. My thanks to Stefano Villani for making me think harder about this.

> the efficacy and use of those sacraments, but shall endeavour that the same be done piously and prudently by every parish priest; *and this even in the vernacular tongue*, if need be, and it can be conveniently done; and in accordance with the form which will be prescribed for each of the sacraments, by the holy Synod, *in a catechism which the bishops shall take care to have faithfully translated into the vulgar tongue, and to have expounded to the people by all parish priests;* as also that, during the solemnization of mass, or the celebration of the divine offices, they explain, in the said vulgar tongue, on all festivals, or solemnities, the sacred oracles, and the maxims of salvation; and that, setting aside all unprofitable questions, they endeavour to impress them on the hearts of all, and to instruct them in the law of the Lord (emphasis added).[49]

Thus, for Županov, in contrast to the traditional view of Trent as having ignored the missions, in actual fact, by acknowledging the importance of vernacular translation: 'opened the door for the development of the specifically Jesuit method of accommodation'.[50] Moreover, even where there already existed *lingua franca* of empire, as in the cases of the Nahuatl of Aztec Mexico and the

[49] Ines Županov, 'Translating the *Doctrina Christiana*: Jesuit linguistic mission before and after the Council of Trent (Sixteenth-seventeenth-century India)' in Michela Catto & Adriano Prosperi, eds., *Trent and Beyond: the council, other powers, other cultures*, (Turnhout: Brepols, 2017), pp. 559-81.
[50] Županov, 'Translating the *Doctrina Christiana*', p. 568.

Quechua of Inca Peru, their writing down and codification created, in effect, new languages which were not automatically comprehended by their intended audience. This was particularly the case with 'ecclesiastical Quechua' which, derived from aristocratic usage in and around Cuzco, was often a second or even a third language for those who lived elsewhere.[51] In other words, multi-lingualism was the norm rather than the exception. However, there is a deeper problem with Sanneh's identification of Christianity's success with its linguisticc translatiblity. He also 'argued against the term 'Global Christianity' on the grounds that it obscures the local particularity of the multiple Christianities of varying cultural contexts, wrongly foregrounding a homogenizing, European form of Christianity. According to him, it was 'World Christianity', in contrast to 'Global Christianity', in which the voices of Global South Christians spoke freely for themselves. But, as Joel Cabrita has eloquently argued, by emphasizing the autonomy of local Christianities, this scholarship perhaps runs the risk of neglecting the other side of the story: that local Christians across the world have highly-prized contact with Christians in the so-called Global North, as well as sustained exchanges with believers in other parts of the southern hemisphere, by choosing to stress only their regional credentials, he has neglected their universalist affiliations.[52]

---

[51] Alan Durston, *Pastoral Quechua*: the history of Christian translation in colonial Peru, 1550-1650, (Notre Dame: Notre Dame University Press, 2007).

[52] Joel Cabrita, 'Revisiting "translatability" and African Christianity: the case of the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church in Zion', *Studies in Church history*, 53

There is also another, closely related issue, with which I will close the main part this chapter: if Christianity's success as a world religion is to be so closely attributed to its linguistic translatability, how do we explain the success of Islam, a religion whose Holy book is written in the language of its revelation, classical Arabic, which is far from the demotic of Arab speakers?[53] Richard Bulliet, for example, has calculated that the proportion of the world Muslim community today composed of descendants of people who converted to Islam between 1500 and 1900 numbers over 50%. By contrast, if one were to perform the same calculation for this planet's present-day Protestants and Catholics whose ancestors had been converted during the same time period, the answer would be under 20%.[54] The answer is to be found, I believe, specifically in Roman Catholicism's *material* rather than *linguistic* translatability in the form of relics, images & other devotional objects.[55]

(2017), pp. 448-75. Cfr. idem, *Text and Authority in the South African Nazaretha Church*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014).

[53] Though see now the eloquent case made by Ronit Ricci for the existence of an 'Arabic cosmopolis' – a deliberate echo of Sheldon Pollock's 'Sanskrit cosmopolis' – in S and SE Asia and for the importance of translation out of Arabic and into the vernacular, specifically, Javanese, Tamil and Malay, for conversion to Islam. See her: *Islam translated: literature, conversion and the Arabic cosmopolis of South and Southeast Asia,* (Chicago, 2011). My thanks to Stefano Villani for pointing me to the significance of this important study. For the pre-modern period, a correspondingly significant role in the spread of Islam was played by translations into the Persian language. See Dick Davies, 'Persian literature' in Robert Irwin ed., *The Cambridge History of Islam*, vol. IV (Cambridge, 2010), pp. 414-23. Thanks to my colleague Harry Munt for his discussion with me on this point.

[54] The lands which converted to Islam during the period c.1500-c.1700 included much of the territory covered by the following modern-day states: Bangladesh, Malaysia, Indonesia, large groups of sub-Saharan Africans and most of the Muslims of Pakistan, India and China. In addition one should factor into calculations the substantial populations of SE Europe and Central Asia. Richard Bulliet, *The Case for Islamo-Christian civilization*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004), pp. 40-41.

[55] This is the subject of my essay: 'Translating Christianity in an Age of Reformations', *Studies in Church History* 53 (2017), pp. 164–195.

However, despite such significant qualifications to the role played by linguistic translation in the making of Roman Catholicism as this planet's first world religion, before bringing this chapter to a close fuller acknowledgement needs to be made of the direct engagement of Rome not only with non-European languages but also with the missions within and without Europe. Here the principal agent of the relevant initiatives was the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, better known simply as Propaganda Fide.[56] The congregation's eventual founding, in 1622, postdated the long held interest of the papacy in converting those to be found outside Western Christendom, an impulse which went back at least to papal support for Franciscan missions to the Mongols of the thirteenth century, though its immediate origins should more properly be located in the sustained engagement of the papacy from Pius V (1566-72) with vigorous sponsorship both of the Crusade against the Ottoman Turks and with promotion of unity with the Greek Orthodox and other Christian Churches in the Levant.[57] However, under the remarkable leadership of its first secretary, Francesco Ingoli, who remained in post from 1622 until his death in 1649, Propaganda Fide promoted Rome's engagement

[56] Giovanni Pizzorusso, *Governare le missioni, conoscere il mondo nel XVII secolo. La Congregazione Pontificia de Propaganda Fide*, (Viterbo, 2018).

[57] Peter Jackson, *The Mongols and the West, 1221-1410*, Harlow, 2005, pp. 256-89. The best account of previous papal initiatives in this area which immediately preceded the foundation of Propaganda Fide see. Josef Metzler, Wegbereiter und Vorläufer der Kongregation. Vorschläge und erste Gründungversuche einer römischen Missionszentrale' in J. Metzler ed., *Sacrae congregationis de propaganda fide memoria rerum, vol. 1/1 1622-1700*, (Rome,/Freiburg/Vienna, 1971), pp. 38-78.

with overseas missions according to a vision of unprecedented scope and attention to detail.[58]

It was also a vision expressed in the form of a series of letters, apparently composed by Ingoli between c.1626 and 1631, addressed to the Milanese Capuchin missionary Valeriano Magni (1586-1661), who was then active in Bohemia and Moravia, which had only lately been recovered for the 'True Faith' subsequent to the Catholic victory at the Battle of White Mountain in 1620. Such a practice of course built upon the already well-established tradition, most vigorously and famously pursued by the Jesuits, of circulating annual letters about the activities of their missionaries to the Indies, which were intended to inspire readers in the Old World, in this case the Catholic princes of Central Europe, to promote the (re)conversion of heretics in Bohemia and Moravia. The only difference was that Ingoli's letters, perhaps owing to their extensive acknowledgement of the difficulties encountered, remained unpublished until 1999.[59] Each of the thirteen cardinals who were members of the new Congregation was allocated a geographical area for which they were responsible, which corresponded mostly to the already existing network of papal nunciatures, (though notoriously, Madrid blocked attempts by the

[58] On the career of Ingoli (1578-1649) see the excellent entry by Giovanni Pizzorusso in *DBI* VOL NUMBER ETC

[59] Francesco Ingoli, *Relazione delle quattro parti del mondo*, ed. Fabio Tosi, (Vatican City, 1999),

papacy to establish a nuncio for the Americas until the 19th century).[60] It is nonetheless noteworthy that no fewer than eight of these regions was European, which further reinforces the need for us to recognise that, from the very outset, the remit of Propaganda Fide was not only, or even primarily, about the non-European missions.

That said, Ingoli devoted one letter each to the four parts of the world which were then seen to comprise the globe: Europe, Asia, Africa and the Americas.[61] Furthermore, the first secretary of Propaganda Fide mapped the Roman Catholic missionary enterprise onto no less a template than the book of Revelation. Discovery of fourth part of the world – the Americas - had been foretold in Revelation (7. 1).[62] Before that, Ezekiel (1, 10) had anticipated this fourfold model when he was vouchsafed a vision of God in the shape of four angels possessing the faces of a man, an ox, a lion and an eagle.[63] Firstly, the man (Matthew) corresponded

[60] This division of the globe by nunciatures was approved by the Congregation of Propaganda Fide on 8 March 1622 and was printed as: *Libellus Divisionis Provinciarum Orbis Terrarum*, (Rome; n.d.), APF, *Miscellanea Varie*, vol. XIV/a, fol. 642 [1-14]. This has been published in Metzler, *Memoria rerum*, III/3, pp. 659-61. Cfr. Pizzorusso, '"Per servitio della Sacra Congregatione De Propaganda Fide". I nunzi apostolici e le missioni tra centralità romana e chiesa universale', *Cheiron*, XV n. 30 (1998), pp. 201-27, (at 207-10).

[61] Ingoli, *Relazione* pp. 11-78 (Europe); 81-176 (Asia); pp. 179-227 (Africa) and pp. 231-67 (America). In addition, there was a final, briefer letter on Rome itself, (pp. 271-89) which surveyed the various institutions in the city that supported the global missionary enterprise.

[62] Ingoli, *Relazione,* p. 232. The relevant scriptural passage in full runs: 'And after these things I saw four angels standing on the four corners of the earth, holding the four winds of the earth, that the wind should not blow on the earth, nor on the sea, nor on any tree'.

[63] Ingoli, *Relazione*, p. 232. 'Their faces looked like this: Each of the four had the face of a human being, and on the right side each had the face of a lion, and on

to Asia, where Adam had been first created and where the ingenuity of mankind was most in evidence in the sophisticated civilizations of Persia, India and China; from which Ingoli concluded: 'it was necessary that the missionaries to these parts were educated men, [capable] of subtle understanding and able to teach.'[64] Next, turning to Europe, Ingoli reasoned that the Lion of Mark was appropriate to a part of the world where the courage and authority of the king of beasts, in the form of the pope as vicar of Christ resident in the imperial city of Rome, was required to tame the inhabitants of this continent.[65] The particular challenge of the missions to Africa was symbolised by the bull of Luke: 'For the most part they [the Africans] are only possessed of small or modest intelligence, credulous and in as much as the bull is suited for sacrifice, one might say not that [Africans] are religious but that they are very superstitious'.[66] This left the Eagle of John for the Americas; just as this was the last of the gospels to be written, argued Ingoli, so it was the last continent to be discovered.[67] What is more, the Eagle corresponded to the generosity of soul displayed by so many of the indigenous peoples in that fourth part of the world, who though they lacked in their native tongues the word for

---

the left the face of an ox; each also had the face of an eagle.'

[64] 'Per la qual cagione converrebbe, che i missionarii, che in quelle parti si mandano, fossero huomini scienziati, e di sottile intendimento, et atti ad insegnare…' Ingoli, *Relazione*, p. 234.

[65] Ingoli, *Relazione*, pp. 234-35.

[66] 'Et in buona parte sono d'ingegno, o piccolo, o mezzano, e facili al credere; et in quanto il Bue, come animale già disposti al sacrificio, significa la religione, sotto essi, non dirò religiosi, solamente, ma superstitiosissimi.' Ingoli, *Relazione,* p. 236.

[67] Ingoli, *Relazione*, p. 238.

a universal, single deity, believed in a pantheon of Gods overseen by a single creator of Heaven and Earth the intercessory role of which was not dissimilar from that of Catholic saints and blesseds, was complemented by awareness of an afterlife and the existence of Heaven and Hell.[68] The natural religiosity of the indigenous Americans was also displayed in the presence of temples manned by priests who were supported by dedicated revenues; though such rituals were also mixed with those of unspeakable cruelty involving human sacrifice.[69] Yet, the inhabitants of the former Inca and Aztec empires were, by the early seventeenth century, 'entirely Christian'.[70] If Cotton Mather, with whose words this chapter opened, had been able to read Ingoli's letter, he would surely have nodded his head in recognition and grim confirmation that his description of the global Roman Catholic missionary enterprise in terms of its: 'unwearied and extravagant labour, [and aim] to propagate the Idolatry and Superstiton of Anti-Christ and advance the Empire of Satan' was all too accurate.

[68] Ingoli, *Relazione*, pp. 239, 265.
[69] Ingoli, *Relazione,* p. 266.
[70] '… sono hoggi del tutto Christiane', Ingoli, *Relazione,* p. 243.